

Historic Preservation Commission (HPC)
MEETING MINUTES

Meeting Date: Thursday, October 2, 2003

Location: Hatton Hall, 34 East Seventh Street

Commissioners

Present: Michael Deskin
Joe Ewan
Bob Gasser
Richard Pagoria
Ann Patterson
Dave Scheatzle
Stu Siefer

Staff Present: Dr. Amy Douglass, CSD Museum Administrator
Gregg Kent, TRS Principal Civil Engineer
Joe Nucci, DSD Historic Preservation Officer
Mark Vinson, DSD City Architect

Public Present:
Angela Dye, ADD
Bill Gustafson, VMR
Vic Linoff, Mesa HPC
Jim Shook, VMR

Call to Order:

6:00 pm, Bob Gasser, Chairman.

I. Welcome to Dr. David Scheatzle

Chairman Gasser introduced Dave Scheatzle as the newest member of the Tempe HPC. [Mayor Giuliano appointed Dave Scheatzle on 08/14/03 to serve and unexpired term ending 3-31-05]

II. Approval of Minutes:

Chairman Gasser called for a motion to approve the August 7, 2003 meeting minutes. *MOTION MADE BY COMMISSIONER PAGORIA & SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER DESKIN TO APPROVE MEETING MINUTES OF THE AUGUST 7, 2003 TEMPE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION.* Discussion prior to vote: Commissioner Siefer asked that the minutes be corrected on page one, item II, first sentence, as follows – change the word “refused” to read “recused”, the correction was acknowledged and the minutes

were corrected. *MOTION TO APPROVE MINUTES AS CORRECTED CARRIED 8-0.*

Chairman Gasser called for a motion to approve the September 11, 2003 meeting minutes of the Tempe HPC meeting as the East Valley Historic Preservation Coalition.

Chairman Gasser stated Cathy Johnson, Scottsdale HPC Chair, called him with a request to correct the minutes to indicate the tour of the Ellis house began at 6:00 prior to the start of the business meeting. The correction was acknowledged and the minutes were corrected as follows.

6:00 Tour of Historic Ellis Residence.

6:49 Call to Order, Cathy Johnson, Scottsdale HPC Chair

MOTION MADE BY COMMISSIONER SIEFER & SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER PAGORIA TO APPROVE MEETING MINUTES OF THE SEPTEMBER 11, 2003 TEMPE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING AS THE EAST VALLEY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COALITION AS CORRECTED. MOTION TO APPROVE MINUTES AS CORRECTED CARRIED 8-0.

III. Presentation: CP/EV LRT Bridge Design

Angela Dye, A Dye Design; Bill Gustafson and Jim Shook; Valley Metro Rail made a presentation on the new design for the proposed rail bridge at the Tempe Town Lake.

New Design Evolved From Engineering "Trellis" Concept

- Ms. Dye explained, as the design developed through initial engineering major features were altered for functional and aesthetic reasons.
- Proposed new design takes forms from the existing railroad bridge.
- Proposed new design is "Y" shaped with stem thickened to resolve forces to grade – deflection governs stiffness for passenger comfort.
- Change from previous designs is fairly dramatic at this 35% engineering phase. Changes resulted from interpretation of "Trellis" concept where beam sizes became so large as to be unattractive.
- Proposed new design relates to existing railroad bridge.
- Contemporary design approach achieves compatibility without imitation.
- Costs for proposed new design are comparable to previous designs.

New Design Provides Opportunity For Illumination

- Proposed new design has a metal mesh "scrim" that can be programmable to project colors and images.
- Proposed illumination of new design may impact historic setting – lighting will be minimized to avoid trespass. Illumination can be turned on and off as appropriate.

- Scrim material is to be determined – material performance properties and characteristics should be field verified prior to final material selection.
- Proposed new design includes a maintenance walkway but no public pedestrian access.

Light Rail Bridge Working Group

- Commissioners Gasser and Siefer will be on the Bridge Design Working Group. Requested copies of plans and drawings for review prior to meeting on 10/20/03.
- Change previous designs 75% engineering phase drawings due February 2005.

Visual Impacts

- Request to render proposed new bridge in relation to existing railroad bridge to indicate contextual relationship. These drawings are anticipated.
- Basic design criteria to allow train passengers good views out over bridge.
- Visual impact on Mill Avenue Bridge will be very limited.
- Visual impact on existing UPRR Bridge limited to narrow locations in Beach Park.
- The SHPO has indicated they are pleased with this proposed new design.

IV. Discussion: Hayden Flour Mill

Officer Nucci explained that the City is looking at costs to clean up and fence the site. He indicated that the \$11.5M acquisition cost has become the subject of much public confusion coming amidst times of economic difficulty for the City. Nucci cited City Manager Manley's weekly email message as a clear explanation of the fund source constraints for capital projects versus operating expenditures and the recognition of this acquisition as an investment in Tempe's future.

Site Maintenance

- Site fencing is planned for increased site security.
- A \$10,200 proposal for clean-up has been received.
- Eligible properties (properties not listed on the National Register) may be eligible for Heritage Fund "Emergency" grants up to \$100,000.00, there is a match required for Heritage Fund Grants.

Significant Structures

- Common misconception that the "Mill" is the 1951 silo structure.
- The circa 1951 cast-in-place grain storage silos are a generic engineering solution to a standard industry function and can be seen across the country. The actual historic structures on this site are the circa 1918 mill buildings along Mill Avenue.
- The SHPO has indicated that this is a National Register Eligible Property.

Site Redevelopment

- This site provides an excellent opportunity for interpretation of Tempe's history.
- Because of the extraordinary significance of the site, redevelopment could effectively emphasize public interpretation of site history as a component feature.
- Several previous proposals have indicated effective site designs incorporating the historic mill buildings into the redevelopment program.

Site Archaeology

- The Archaeological testing/interpretive archaeology work plan (ARS 1999) would provide a methodical approach to determining what site features were appropriate for conservation, interpretation, or preservation. Archaeological testing/interpretive archaeology as proposed in 1999 would provide important information to assist in developing an informed redevelopment program.
- Chairman Gasser stated the Tempe HPC should recommend a program of archaeological testing/interpretive archaeology prior to any additional site demolition.

Property Information

- The THM/HPO do not have good photographs from the period of significance of the mill (circa 1918).
- Sanborn Maps exist to show the progress of development at the site (1890, 1893, 1898, 1901, and 1915).
- Numerous histories of the mill are available from which a synthesis could be created to raise the awareness of the significant features.

Tempe HPC Actions

- The Tempe HPO has an obligation to advise the SHPO of actions that could adversely affect a National Register Eligible property.
- The Tempe HPC should explore opportunities for preservation funding for the conservation of this property.
- The Tempe HPC should act to inform Mayor and Council of the significance of the site features and not "muddy-it-up" with what we think should be done.
- Chairman Gasser will prepare a letter to cover transmittal of a brief history to Mayor and Council.

Rumor Control

- The City is being confronted by popular opinion regarding the \$11.5M expenditure to reacquire the property in the wake of MCW's exit. In the midst of Tempe's difficult financial circumstances, the property acquisition is creating controversy.
- The Tempe HPC should act quickly to provide the Mayor & Council with factual history and information regarding significant features.

Register Nomination

- It was discussed that the Tempe HPC should consider listing this property on the Tempe Historic Property Register.
- There is no question that this property should be on the Tempe Historic Property Register and that the Tempe HPC should be recommending its listing.
- Staff was directed to begin researching this and prepare a report and recommendation to the Tempe HPC for listing. Identification of site boundaries and resources should be included toward a possible nomination.
- A Public Hearing is required for the Tempe HPC to recommend designation.
- Unless specified otherwise, designation is parcel based, in the case of the mill, the boundary would be the Hayden Butte Preserve.

MOTION MADE BY COMMISSIONER PATTERSON & SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER SCHEATZLE, FOR THE TEMPE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION TO REQUEST MORE INFORMATION FROM STAFF REGARDING THE HISTORIC SIGNIFICANCE OF THE HAYDEN FLOUR MILL PROPERTY IN PURSUIT OF A POSSIBLE NOMINATION TO THE TEMPE HISTORIC PROPERTY REGISTER. Discussion prior to vote: Commissioner Siefer stated that the City is now in the position of the developer and that an excessively strong advocacy position might be poorly timed and viewed as adversarial. *MOTION CARRIED 7-0. Commissioner Pagoria abstaining.*

V. Discussion: Tour Of 7 Eligible Subdivisions

Officer Nucci reported that all Commissioners plan to attend the October 11, 2003 tour with the exception of Commissioner Scheatzle, who will be out of state on that date. In addition, Scott Solliday will be on board as will DSD Manager Melanie Hobden. At this time, two members from the Mayor's Neighborhood Advisory Commission plan to attend.

VI. Discussion: SHPO HPF Pass Through Grant

HPO Nucci reported the draft RFP has been distributed for 30-day review to stakeholders including the SRP-MIC, ASU, and SHPO. Nucci identified the following critical schedule dates for future Tempe HPC action.

11/06/03	Tempe HPC Meeting Agenda Item Revisions to RFP *
01/08/04	Tempe HPC Meeting Agenda Item Vendor Selection *
04/01/04	Tempe HPC Meeting Agenda Item Review Draft Report *
07/01/04	Tempe HPC Meeting Agenda Item Review Revised Report *
09/02/04	Tempe HPC Meeting Agenda Item Review Final Report *

*dates are negotiable with selected vendor and assume Tempe HPC will meet on the first Thursday of the month in 2004.

VII. Discussion: Zoning and Development Code Rewrite

On September 29, 2003, Commissioners Ewan and Siefer and Officer Nucci met with Fred Brittingham (DSD Deputy Manager – Planning) and Ryan Levesque (DSD Downtown Management Planner) to incorporate relevant references to preservation in the draft code.

- The draft code is scheduled for public hearings at P&Z on 11/12/03 and 12/09/03.
- The comments included in the supplemental report (meeting handout) were communicated to DSD Staff in time for the October 1, 2003 deadline to be included in the first round comments transmitted to P&Z.
- Additional comments have been developed and will be transmitted to DSD Staff in the second round comments transmitted to P&Z (deadline 11/07/03):
 - 1) Intro to reference “preservation of cultural resources”.
 - 2) Relief from standards at designated properties.
 - 3) Definitions references.
- Tempe HPC will send a representative to attend the P&Z public hearing on 11/02/03.

VIII. Discussion: Tempe HPC Brochure for EV-HPC

Chairman Gasser mentioned that the brochure prepared for the East Valley Historic Preservation Coalition meeting was a great success.

- Officer Nucci suggested revising the brochure to omit Commissioner’s contact information so as to have something available for public distribution.
- EV-HPC reference would be removed.
- View-From-The-Chair could be written to a broader audience.
- Insert map has been revised to read more clearly.

Chairman Gasser called attention to the GP2030 process recognizing the 7 first-tier and the 25 second-tier subdivisions identified in Solliday 2001 as “Cultural Resource Areas”.

Discussion of the following items tabled:

- 🕒 **East Valley HPC Coalition**
- 🕒 **Preservation Goals & Objectives**
- 🕒 **Discussion: Upcoming Agenda Topics**
- 🕒 **Questions & Answers HPO Report**

Adjourn

Meeting adjourned by THPC consensus at approximately 8:09 PM.

Minutes approved and adopted 11/06/03 Tempe HPC

Bob Gasser, Chair